

APPENDIX

Individuals notified, silenced, excommunicated, or otherwise investigated and disciplined/censured by the Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith, directly or indirectly

Cardinal Joseph Ratzinger, Prefect (1979 - 2005)

(in reverse chronological order)

2005

Fr. Thomas Reese, SJ—Under pressure from the CDF, the Jesuits removed Reese from his post as editor of *America* magazine for his insistence on presenting multiple points of view (and not only official church teaching) on such hot-button issues as HIV/AIDS, homosexuality, abortion/contraception, priestly celibacy and pluralism/ecumenism. A renowned scholar on church organization and politics, he has since gone on sabbatical at Santa Clara University.

2004

Fr. Roger Haight, SJ—Was found to be in grave doctrinal error and banned from teaching Catholic theology. The CDF took issue with his take on Jesus' divinity, the Trinity and the meaning and value of Jesus' death and resurrection, among other points.

2002

The Danube Seven—In late June, seven women were “illicitly and invalidly” ordained as priests, and were promptly excommunicated on the Feast of Mary Magdalene (July 22) when they did not repent as the CDF ordered.

Fr. Willigis Jäger, OSB/Ko-un Roshi—This German Benedictine and Zen master was ordered to cease all public activity (teaching, writing and presenting). According to John L. Allen, Jr., of the *National Catholic Reporter* (March 1, 2002), “Jäger has been faulted for playing down the Christian concept of God as a person in his work as a spiritual guide, and for stressing mystical experience above

doctrinal truths.” In other words, he questioned the relationship between spiritual experience and doctrinal claims.

Fr. Josef Imbach, OFM Conv—Assigned a year of “reflection,” or suspension, while his 1995 book on miracles (in English translation, *Miracles: A 21st Century Interpretation*, 1988) was under review. Again, John L. Allen, Jr., writes in the *NCR*: “Imbach...was accused of not believing in the divinity of Jesus, of refusing the magisterium of the church, of describing the gospels as teaching texts rather than historically reliable accounts, and of excluding the possibility of miracles. He denied holding these views.”

Fr. Thomas Aldworth, OFM—This Chicago theologian, author and pastor was censured for how he presented teachings on original sin and related points in two books he wrote for popular audiences, *Shaping a Healthy Religion, Especially If You Are Catholic* (1985) and *Fashioning a Healthier Religion* (1992).

2001

Fr. Paul Collins, MSC—Resigns from active priesthood following his investigation (details below, 1998). He has continued speaking out on issues of sexual abuse and aspects of the papal office.

Fr. Antonio Rosmini Serbati—The case involving this 19th-century priest, whose works were once on

the list of prohibited books, was reconsidered and partially rehabilitated.

Fr. Marciano Vidal, CSSR—Vidal’s writings as investigated (see below, 1997) would be revised and include evidence of the notification, but would not be permitted for use in theological formation.

Fr. Jacques Dupuis, SJ—Censured, but never officially disciplined, for his teachings on religious pluralism that (among other things and by Ratzinger’s reading) did not insist sufficiently on Jesus Christ’s unique capacity to save.

Abp. Emmanuel Milingo—Long an unconventional healer and unofficial exorcist as well as a critic of what he perceived as the hierarchy’s “toleration” of homosexuality and lack of celibacy within the priesthood, he was threatened with excommunication for attempting marriage to Maria Sung through the Rev. Sun Myung Moon’s Unification Church and refusing the discipline of celibacy. He renounced the marriage.

Fr. Gustavo Gutiérrez, OP—Seeking a haven from his conservative archbishop, Gutiérrez joined the Dominicans.

Fr. Roger Haight, SJ—The CDF was not satisfied with the clarifications he offered as responses to their questions, so it began a full investigation of his work.

2000

Sr. Lavinia Byrne, IBVM—Under fire for her beliefs about contraception and, more significantly, the ordination of women to the priesthood, she refused to recant and was compelled to leave religious life.

Prof. Dr. Reinhard Meßner (Innsbruck, Austria)—This historian of liturgy came under scrutiny for his writings (done while a graduate student) on the sacramental life of the church. The CDF issued a 16-point censure, with the main points being that: 1) thanks to the magisterium’s role in interpreting

revelation, later (and present) church practice should not be evaluated based on early church experiences; 2) Christ definitively instituted all seven sacraments, as well as apostolic succession; and 3) “there can be no contradiction between the declarations of church authorities and the practice of the church in liturgies. In other words, historical liturgical texts or data may not be regarded as authoritative when they conflict with church teaching.”

Fr. Roger Haight, SJ—The CDF notified him of questions regarding his Christology and theological method as written in his 1999 book *Jesus: The Symbol of God*. He was suspended from his teaching post at Weston Jesuit School of Theology.

1999

Michael Stoeber—The board of trustees at the Catholic University of America denied tenure to this professor of Eastern religions in the Religion and Religious Education department despite unanimous approval by the Academic Senate. There was concern about some of his writings that compared Hindu reincarnation and Christian resurrection. The CDF became involved in the review, since all eight US cardinals and 16 other bishops are on the board; it was at one cardinal’s request that Stoeber’s work was scrutinized.

Sr. Jeannine Gramick, SSND & Fr. Robert Nugent, SDS—The CDF finally sanctioned them for not adequately representing authentic church teaching about homosexuality. Their religious congregations did likewise, essentially prohibiting them from participating in public ministry to homosexuals. Nugent accepted the sanctions; Gramick, in conscience, left her order to join the Loretto Sisters in 2004.

1998

Perry Schmidt-Leukel—This lay theologian came under fire for his 1997 book *Theology of Religions*; he has since not been permitted to teach in German Catholic theology departments.

Fr. Anthony de Mello, SJ—The renowned retreat master, spiritual director and psychotherapist was

censured posthumously (d. 1987) for not being Christocentric enough and, more generally, not hewing sufficiently closely to Catholic orthodoxy, i.e. being too open to readers and seekers who were not specifically Catholic or even religious.

Fr. Jacques Dupuis, SJ—Investigated for suspected heresy in his 1998 book *Toward a Christian Theology of Religious Pluralism*.

Sr. Lavinia Byrne, IBVM—Ratzinger directs Liturgical Press (owned and run by the Benedictine monks at St. John's Abbey, Collegeville, Minnesota) to destroy all 1,300 remaining copies of Byrne's book *Woman at the Altar* in stock.

Fr. Paul Collins, MSC—This Australian priest, church historian, and broadcaster was investigated for his book *Papal Power*, and the CDF accused him of holding “an erroneous concept of papal infallibility,” as well as misunderstanding *sensus fidelium* to include only the laity and not the hierarchy as well.

1997

Fr. Tissa Balasuriya, OMI—This notification was a response to the escalation of complaints from the bishops' conference of Sri Lanka against Balasuriya for his 1994 book *Mary and Human Liberation*. The bishops exhorted the faithful to avoid this text, which, they said, “contained statements incompatible with the faith of the Church regarding the doctrine of revelation and its transmission, Christology, soteriology and Mariology.” The final push was Balasuriya's refusal to sign a prepared profession of faith; he argued that he was still within the bounds of orthodoxy. After prolonged censure and continued public outcry, he was reinstated in 1998.

Fr. Marciano Vidal, CSsR—The CDF began its investigation of Vidal based on his body of work, with specific attention to a three-volume manual he wrote on morality. They took specific issue with his portrayal of the relationship between scripture, tradition, the magisterium and the theologian, as well as particular points on person, sexuality, bioethics, social morality, eschatology and utopia.

1995

Bp. Jacques Gaillot—He was removed from his post as bishop of Evreux, France, for unorthodox stances and conduct regarding poverty, homelessness and contraception. He was instead sent to lead the diocese of Partenia, a long-lost African diocese, and is doing so as a virtual diocese online (partenia.org).

Mrs. Vassula Ryden—This Greek Orthodox woman claimed to see visions and bring messages directly from Jesus. The CDF warned the faithful of errors in her writings and speeches and claimed that these were products of her meditation rather than any divine or supernatural source.

Ivone Gebara, SND—The CDF picked up where the Brazilian hierarchy left off (see below, 1993), reviewed her other writings, and pressured her order to discipline her. She was silenced for two years.

Sr. Lavinia Byrne, IBVM—Bishop John Kinney (St. Cloud, Minnesota) reported to the CDF the US publication of Byrne's 1994 book *Woman at the Altar*, which argued for women in the priesthood; by a stroke of timing, it was already in process at the UK publisher when John Paul II issued *Ordinatio Sacerdotalis*. She asked that the document be included as an addendum to her text. Pending further investigation, her superiors asked her to refrain from teaching or speaking publicly about women's ordination.

Sr. Carmel McEnroy, RSM—In 1994, McEnroy was one of hundreds who signed an open letter to John Paul II in response to *Ordinatio Sacerdotalis*, requesting further discussion on the issue of women's ordination. The letter ran in the *National Catholic Reporter* and did not include her school affiliation. Nonetheless, she was fired for doing so, and without due process. (As with William Donn's 1987 case below, it is unclear what role the CDF may have played in this matter, or whether it is more appropriately local. Also, as with the silencing of Charles Curran and many others, this points up the raw tensions between academic/intellectual

freedom and the CDF's expectations that theologians should present—and assent to—church teaching without ever engaging it critically.)

1993

Ivone Gebara, SND—The Brazilian nun was investigated by her nation's bishops for having publicly defended legal abortion. They resolved the matter by having her affirm her opposition to abortion.

1992

Fr. Eugen Drewermann—This priest and Jungian psychotherapist was criticized for exegeting biblical texts with psychoanalytic criteria in mind (see his 1988 book *Tiefenpsychologie und Exegese*), as well as for his views on resurrection and the virgin birth. In 1991 his archbishop denied him the right to preach or teach and began proceedings against him.

Fr. André Guindon, OMI—Investigations began into his 1986 book, *The Sexual Creators*, specifically for his views on homosexuality, premarital sex and birth control.

1991

Fr. Leonardo Boff, OFM—Boff was nearly silenced again, so that he would not attend and speak out at the Earth Summit (Rio de Janeiro, 1992). The following year, he “promoted himself to the state of laity” and left the Franciscans and eventually the priesthood.

1990s

The Society of Jesus—Gerald Renner of the *National Catholic Reporter* (August 11, 2000) notes: “Several American Jesuits have been targeted by Vatican crackdowns in recent years. Specifically, the Vatican has refused to approve at least five US Jesuits to serve as administrators or members of pontifical faculties at Weston School of Theology, Cambridge, Mass., or Jesuit School of Theology, Berkeley, Calif. The Jesuits include: Frs. William J. Rewak, Edward Glynn, Michael Buckley, David Hollenbach and John Baldwin.”

1988

Fr. Gustavo Gutiérrez—The CDF attempts yet another investigation of Gutiérrez.

Abp. Marcel Lefebvre—This staunch opponent of Vatican II reforms (such as ecumenism and the Mass in vernacular rather than Latin), who founded the Society of St. Pius X, was excommunicated for consecrating four bishops despite warnings from John Paul II, thus risking schism and jeopardizing apostolic succession.

Sr. Jeannine Gramick, SSND & Fr. Robert Nugent, SDS—Investigations renewed.

1987

Dr. John McNeill, SJ—In 1986 he disobeyed his 1977 orders demanding silence about homosexuality, thus compelling the Jesuits to expel him formally. The expulsion became effective in 1987, and he has since worked as a psychotherapist in private practice and remains active in DignityUSA.

Fr. William Donn—Was similarly forced to resign from the Newman Center at St. Cloud State University in Minnesota for disagreeing with the Church's teachings on homosexuality. (It is unclear what role the CDF may have played in this matter, or whether it is more appropriately local.)

Abp. Raymond G. Hunthausen (Seattle archdiocese)—After much protest from the archdiocese and fellow bishops, the Vatican reinstates Hunthausen's authority and exchanges the auxiliary bishop for a coadjutor instead.

1986

Fr. Charles Curran—Formerly a professor of moral theology at Catholic University of America, he had his license to teach Catholic theology revoked because of his challenges to *Humanae Vitae* and related stances on contraception and medical ethics. The underlying reason, though, was his insistence on his right to challenge (and dissent from) noninfallible teachings. CUA formally dismissed

Curran the following year. He presently teaches in the Religious Studies Department at Southern Methodist University.

Fr. Gustavo Gutiérrez—The CDF issues yet another instruction against certain aspects of liberation theology.

Fr. Edward Schillebeeckx, OP—Investigated for his 1985 book *The Church with a Human Face*.

Fr. György Bulányi, SP—This Hungarian priest and founder of the base Christian community movement was accused of heresy for encouraging the growing conscientious objector movement against compulsory military service. In 1981, the Hungarian bishops condemned his writings, forbade him to practice as a priest and forwarded his case to the CDF, which excommunicated him. He was officially rehabilitated in 1998.

1985

Fr. Leonardo Boff, OFM—The renowned Brazilian human rights advocate, liberation theologian and suspected Marxist was silenced (forbidden to teach, speak or write and suspended from religious duties) for his liberation theology book *Church: Charism and Power*. The CDF's concerns lay in the areas of church structure, dogmas and revelation, the exercise of sacred power and the role of the laity. International pressure led to the silencing being lifted one year later.

Abp. Raymond G. Hunthausen (Seattle archdiocese)—As a result of Abp Hickey's report (see below, 1983), the Vatican appoints an auxiliary bishop to Seattle and transfers much of Hunthausen's power to his subordinate.

1984

Sr. Barbara Ferraro, SNDdeN & Sr Patricia Hussey, SNDdeN—They were among a group of 91 priests and nuns who had signed a full-page ad in the *New York Times* that noted the diversity of opinions about abortion among Catholics. The Vatican

ordered all signatories to recant and withdraw support for the ad. Ferraro and Hussey refused and finally left their order in 1988.

Fr. Gustavo Gutiérrez—The CDF issues an instruction against certain aspects of liberation theology.

Fr. Edward Schillebeeckx, OP—Investigated for his 1980 book *The Ministry in the Church*, in which he espoused the "Protestant" notion that a Christian community should have some say in choosing its ministers.

Sr. Jeannine Gramick, SSND & Fr Robert Nugent, SDS—Investigations begin into their ministry (New Ways Ministry) to homosexuals.

1983

Sr. Mary Agnes Mansour, RSM—She was the director of Michigan's Department of Social Services, where her job included administering Medicaid funds for abortions. She had taken the job with her bishop's permission, yet this was deemed to conflict with her role as a nun. According to the Sisters of Mercy, "she said that while she personally abhorred abortion, as long as it was legal it would be unfair to permit it only for women who had the means to afford it." A papal emissary delivered an ultimatum: leave her DSS post or leave her order. She reluctantly chose the latter. A lifelong educator and social reformer, she was inducted into the Michigan Women's Hall of Fame in 1988.

Sr. Elizabeth Morancy, RSM & Sr. Arlene Violet, RSM—Both women were active in political life in Rhode Island, having been elected to office as state representative and attorney general respectively. Like Mansour above, each was presented with an ultimatum and chose to follow her ministerial vocations.

Fr. Ernesto Cardenal—John Paul II scolded this liberation theologian, priest and poet (and four other priests) for serving in the Sandinista government.

The Vatican ordered them to quit those posts. Cardinal declined and consequently was denied the authority to serve as a priest. He continued as the minister of culture until 1988 and eventually left the Sandinista party in 1994, levying charges of corruption against the changing leadership.

Fr. Gustavo Gutiérrez—The Vatican notified the Peruvian bishops of 10 suspect points in Gutiérrez’ writing (on liberation theology) and demands that they condemn him. The bishops refused.

Abp. Raymond G. Hunthausen (Seattle archdiocese)—Investigated following complaints of liturgical abuse and for his recognition of DignityUSA, an organization of GLBT Catholics. Abp James Hickey (Washington, DC) performed a visitation and review at the Vatican’s request.

Cdl. Joseph Höffner—Archbishop of Cologne, investigated regarding the “Work of the Angels.” No further details available.

Abbé Georges de Nantes—This archconservative French priest’s notoriously anti-Vatican II activities (since the opening of the council) earned him a suspension from his superior. Comparable to Marcel Lefebvre, he founded the League of the Catholic Counter-Reformation (CRC) and wrote “Books of Accusation” against Paul VI, John Paul II and the author of the 1993 *Catechism*.

Abp. Pierre Martin Ngo Dinh Thuc—Excommunicated for consecrating (from 1976 onward) many bishops without papal approval, thus fostering splinter groups, courting schism and risking apostolic succession.

Fr. Matthew Fox, OP—This Dominican theologian taught what he called “creation spirituality,” which, critics argued, “contaminated” Catholic teachings and practices with New Age sensibilities. For “advocating panentheism,” and additionally for his views on sexuality and original sin, he was

censured and forbidden to teach. He was dismissed from the Dominicans in 1993 for refusing to return home to the Midwest and received as an Episcopal priest in 1994.

1982

Bp. Alan C. Clark—This bishop of East Anglia was co-chair of the Anglican Roman Catholic International Commission (ARCIC), a group working toward theological rapprochement between the two churches. He was investigated concerning ambiguities and points of theological conflict—real presence in the Eucharist, apostolic succession, interpretation of scripture and women’s ordination—in a report he wrote on the commission’s behalf.

Fr. Anthony Kosnik (Detroit archdiocese)—Following the investigation for the *Human Sexuality* study, Kosnik was pressured to leave his faculty post at SS. Cyril & Methodius Seminary. The school rallied successfully to get him reinstated, but he was eventually forced to resign altogether the following year.

1980s

The Society of Jesus—In a *New Yorker* article (May 2, 2005), Jane Kramer argues that Jesuits were systematically targeted because their commitments and activities (e.g. liberation theology) were out of step with the ascendant priorities and values of the Vatican in John Paul II’s papacy. She wrote: “During [Ratzinger’s] first ten years as Prefect [of the Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith], the Jesuits were censured for challenging papal teachings on contraception, parts of their constitution were suspended, and their Vicar General, Vincent O’Keefe, a passionate advocate for social justice, was removed.” (39) She does not make O’Keefe’s particular role clear.

Dates unspecified

Fr. Karl Rahner—One of the 20th century’s theological giants, Rahner was often in the Vatican’s eye—silenced under John XXIII, rehabilitated

under Paul VI, peritus for the German bishops at Vatican II, and then back under scrutiny during John Paul II's reign. The issues of greatest concern for the CDF from his corpus include priestly ordination, contraception and his classic notion of "the anonymous Christian." After his death (1984) and by the time of his centenary (2004), the CDF had come around to declare him orthodox at last.

Bp. Dom Pedro Casaldáliga (Sao Félix, Brazil)—This liberation theologian was criticized on many occasions for his political engagement beyond the borders of his own diocese.

Fr. August Bernhard Hasler—This priest, historian and former staffer of the Vatican's Secretariat for Christian Unity published his 1979 book *How the Pope Became Infallible*, a study of Pius XII's push for this power. Under fire like Küng before him, he eventually left the priesthood.

"Six Claretian priests from Madrid" were noted in an *NCR* article by Dawn Gibeau ("Today's sinners in eyes of the Vatican may very well be tomorrow's saints," February 3, 1995), but no further details on dates or the reason for their being investigated were mentioned.

Msgr. Luigi Sartori—The former president of the Italian Theological Association and consultant to the Secretariat for Non-Christians was denounced to the CDF by the Padua branch of *Communion and Liberation*, and as a result his teaching privileges at the Lateran University were severely restricted.

• • •

Other noteworthy investigations and censures leading into Ratzinger's tenure:

1979

Fr. Hans Küng—His license to teach Catholic theology was revoked, but he remained on the

Tübingen faculty, teaching ecumenical theology instead.

Fr. Edward Schillebeeckx, OP—The CDF began investigating him for his Christology, but bowed to international pressure the following year to end the drive for a trial. Schillebeeckx has since continued to write pieces that purportedly conflict with church teaching, and he receives notifications regularly.

Fr. Anthony Kosnik (Detroit archdiocese)—Came under fire for his theology in *Human Sexuality*, a study he co-authored on behalf of the Catholic Theological Society. The Vatican disliked the study's theology and Kosnik was pressured to resign in 1982 from Ss. Cyril and Methodius Seminary. Seminarians and faculty threatened to boycott the school's spring commencement if Kosnik was not reinstated. He got his job back, but was forced to resign the next year.

Fr. Jacques Pohier, OP—For his teachings on the resurrection, he has the distinction of being the first theologian John Paul II disciplined as pope. Then the dean of theology faculty at a French Dominican theological school, he could no longer teach theology, say Mass or participate in liturgies. He left the Dominicans six years later.

Fr. Charles Curran—Investigations begin.

1977

Dr. John McNeill, SJ—He was silenced and forbidden to discuss homosexuality or minister to homosexuals.

1975

Fr. Hans Küng—While Ratzinger was archbishop of Munich, investigations began regarding his views on papal infallibility.

Fr. Bernard Häring (German Redemptorist)—Originally in the Vatican's good graces, especially under John XXIII, he was publicly critical of *Humanae Vitae* upon its release (1968) and not long

afterward became the subject of investigation by the CDF. He was equally critical of John Paul II's *Veritatis Splendor*. The charges against him were never entirely resolved before his death in 1998.

1974

Dr. John McNeill, SJ—Investigations on McNeill for his views on homosexuality began.

1968

Fr. Edward Schillebeeckx, OP—Dared to question Mary's virginity. Karl Rahner and the Dutch church successfully defended him.

1967

Abp. Clarence G Isenmann—Details of investigation unavailable/unclear.